LIME Working Group   K. Lam, Ed.
Internet-Draft   E. Varma, Ed.
Intended status: Informational   Nokia
Expires: September 19, 2016   S. Mansfield, Ed.
                                                                  Ericsson
                                                            Y. Tochio, Ed.
                                                                   Fujitsu
                                                      H. van Helvoort, Ed.
                                                              Hai Gaoming BV
                                                            M. Vissers, Ed.
                                                                     Huawei
                                                             P. Doolan, Ed.
                                                                   Coriant
                                                            March 18, 2016

Existing Support for Network Operations in Multilayer Transport Network
        based upon unified approach to OAM (Layer 0 - Layer 2)
          draft-lam-lime-summary-l0-l2-layer-independent-04

Abstract

   This draft summarizes the existing ITU-T SG 15 standards, (Layer 0 -
   Layer 2) both technology-specific and generic across these
   technologies, relevant to leveraging OAM to support fault management,
   performance monitoring, and configuration management. Knowledge from
   this domain may be leveraged for the benefit of developing generic
   layer independent management for other layers.

Status of This Memo

Copyright Notice

Table of Contents

1. Introduction

   A comprehensive set of Operations, Administration, and Maintenance
   (OAM) capabilities is essential for supporting the critical network
   operations of fault management, performance monitoring, and
   configuration management. For this reason in the ITU-T, Layer 0 -
   Layer 2 technologies have been designed with extensive OAM
   capabilities (e.g., as specified in [ITU-T_G.709], [ITU-T_G.707],
   [ITU-T_G.8012], etc.) Considerable effort has been expended to
   establish a coherent approach to OAM that allows monitoring of the
   status and performance of (stacked) connections, including generic
   layer independent principles and inter-layer interworking. Thus, the
   OAM architecture used in transport networks has a common behavior
   across all technologies and layer networks. This draft summarizes
   ITU-T Recommendations that specify the generic architecture,
   principles, and models, both technology specific and generic,
   developed to support management of L0-L2 connections based upon a
   unified and consistent OAM view of multi-layer networks. It should
   be noted that the OAM and management framework and requirements for
   MPLS-TP, which is L2.5, has also been based upon these principles
   (e.g., RFC 6371 [RFC6371], RFC 5860 [RFC5860], RFC 5950 [RFC5950],
   and RFC 5951 [RFC5951].

   It is believed that the generic architecture, principles and models
   specified in the material summarized herein may be leveraged in
   considerations of a common approach to OAM management for other layer
   networks (e.g., Layer 3-Layer 7).

1.1. Requirements Language

   The key words "MUST", "MUST NOT", "REQUIRED", "SHALL", "SHALL NOT",
   "SHOULD", "SHOULD NOT", "RECOMMENDED", "MAY", and "OPTIONAL" in this
   document are to be interpreted as described in RFC 2119 [RFC2119].

2. Terminology

   Anomaly: The smallest discrepancy that can be observed between actual
   and desired characteristics of an item. The occurrence of a single
   anomaly does not constitute an interruption in ability to perform a
   required function. Anomalies are used as the input for the
   Performance Monitoring (PM) process and for detection of defects
   (from [ITU-T_G.806], Section 3.7).

   Defect: The density of anomalies has reached a level where the
   ability to perform a required function has been interrupted. Defects
   are used as input for performance monitoring, the control of
   consequent actions, and the determination of fault cause (from
   [ITU-T_G.806], Section 3.24).

Fault: A fault is the inability of a function to perform a required
action. This does not include an inability due to preventive
maintenance, lack of external resources, or planned actions (from
[ITU-T_G.806], Section 3.26).

Fault cause: A single disturbance or fault may lead to the detection
of multiple defects. A fault cause is the result of a correlation
process that is intended to identify the defect that is
representative of the disturbance or fault that is causing the
problem (from [ITU-T_G.806], Section 3.27).

Failure: The fault cause persisted long enough to consider the
ability of an item to perform a required function to be terminated.
The item may be considered as failed; a fault has now been detected
(from [ITU-T_G.806], Section 3.25).

Equipment Management Function (EMF): The management functions within
an NE (see [ITU-T_G.7710]).

Element Management System (EMS)

Information Model (IM): An information model condenses domain
knowledge and insights to provide a representation of its essential
concepts, structures, and interrelationships. It models managed
objects at a conceptual level, independent of any specific
implementations or protocols used to transport the data.

Layer 0 - Layer 2: Refers to physical (photonic), physical
(electrical), and data link (e.g., Ethernet) transport technology,
respectively.

Network Management System (NMS)

Network Element (NE)

Operations, Administration, and Maintenance (OAM)

o On-demand OAM - OAM actions that are initiated via manual
   intervention for a limited time to carry out diagnostics. On-
   demand OAM can result in singular or periodic OAM actions during
   the diagnostic time interval.

o Proactive OAM - OAM actions that are carried on continuously to
   permit timely reporting of fault and/or performance status.

3. Network Operation Supported by L0-L2 OAM

   OAM mechanisms include the tools and utilities to plan, install,
   monitor and troubleshoot a network layer. While the specific set of
   OAM mechanisms in a layer depends upon the technology (e.g.,
   [ITU-T_G.709] on OTN, [ITU-T_G.707] on SDH, [ITU-T_G.8013] on
   Ethernet), they all support the same fault management, performance
   monitoring, and configuration management operations and processes.
   As noted previously, MPLS-TP OAM (e.g., [ITU-T_G.8113.2], [RFC6424],
   [RFC6428], etc.) was also designed to support L0-L2 operations and
   processes. Some OAM functions are implemented in hardware (data
   plane inherent, such as Tandem Connection Monitoring (TCM) or
   Performance Monitoring (PM)), while other functions can be
   implemented mostly in lower software layers.

   Fault management includes defect detection, fault localization, fault
   reporting, and protection switching [OTN Handbook, Chapter 3].

   o Defect detection: Failures affecting the transport of client
      information are detected by continuous pro-active checking.
      Persistent failures are considered to be service-affecting
      defects. Detected defects are correlated with other detected
      defects to find the most probable cause of the failure and
      consequent actions, such as protection switching, are taken.

   o Fault localization: If the defect information is insufficient to
      locate the failure, on-demand OAM functions can be used to
      determine the cause of the defect more accurately.

   o Fault reporting: Persistent defects are reported to the network
      management system to provide the appropriate alarm reports to
      maintenance staff for maintaining the desired quality of service
      level.

   o Protection switching: After a defect has been detected, a
      protection switch can be initiated as a consequent action to
      restore the interrupted traffic, and thus improve the
      availability.

   Performance monitoring includes measuring the performance (e.g.,
   packet losses, bit errors, etc.) of the transport of client
   information in order to verify the quality of service and to estimate
   the transport integrity.

   Configuration management includes indicating the operational state of
   a connection; e.g., whether it can be used to transport client data
   or whether the set-up of the connection is completed.

4. L0-L2 Architecture and Management Standards

   Figure 1 below is a summary of relevant technology specific and
   generic L0-L2 transport architecture and management standards.

	Transport Tech. Generic	Transport Technology Specific			
		OTN	Carrier Ethernet	MPLS-TP Note 2	SDH
Transport Architecture	G.800 G.805	G.872	G.8010	G.8110.1	G.803
Operations Aministration Maintenance	G.806	G.709	G.8013	G.8113.x series	G.707
Equipment Function	G.806	G.798	G.8021	G.8121.x series	G.783
Management Requirement	G.7710	G.874	G.8051	G.8151	G.784
Mgmt Interface Protocol-neutral Info Model	G.7711	G.874.1	G.8052	G.8152	G.774 series Note 1

Note 1: The model had been specified, but not in a protocol neutral
        manner.
Note 2: MPLS-TP is actually L2.5; it is included as it falls
        under the generic transport management umbrella (as per design).

            Figure 1: L0-L2 Architecture and Management Standards

4.1. Generic Transport Layer and Technology Independent Standards

4.1.1. Generic Transport Architecture

   Recommendations [ITU-T_G.800] and [ITU-T_G.805] provide a technology
   independent and model-based description of transport network
   functionality. The first generic functional model based architecture
   Recommendation was [ITU-T_G.805], which describes connection oriented
   networks. [ITU-T_G.800] was subsequently developed to provide a
   common framework to describe both connection-oriented and
   connectionless networks. The descriptions are compatible with those

of the earlier generic Recommendations (e.g., [ITU-T_G.805]). These
standard model-based approaches:

o Enable the description of the generic characteristics of networks
   using a common language at a level that transcends technology and
   physical architecture choices.

o Provide a view of functions or entities that may be distributed
   among various equipment.

o Concurrently specify transport and management functionality.

These generic functional architectures of transport networks are the
basis for a harmonized set of functional architecture Recommendations
for specific transport layer network technologies that use circuit
switching or packet switching technology (e.g. [ITU-T_G.803] for
SDH, [ITU-T_G.872] for OTN, [ITU-T_G.8010] for Carrier Ethernet,
[ITU-T_G.8110.1] for MPLS-TP). These transport technology specific
architecture Recommendations are used as the basis for a
corresponding set of Recommendations for equipment specifications,
including OAM and management.

4.1.2. Generic processing of transport equipment OAM functions

The development of the OAM architecture used by ITU-T in transport
networks started around 1990, and basic generic OAM functions were
first defined in the period 1990-1993 and described in Recommendation
[ITU-T_G.806]. Since that time, this initial OAM architecture has
been extended to assure it remains generic with respect to emerging
transport technologies. The extended OAM functionality included the
definition of a transport maintenance entity with end-points and
intermediate-points, pro-active and on-demand OAM functions, defect
correlation, and alarm suppression, etc. The generic OAM
architecture in [ITU-T_G.806] has been used as the common basis for
all technology-specific transport equipment specifications (e.g.,
[ITU-T_G.783] for SDH, [ITU-T_G.798] for OTN, [ITU-T_G.8021] for
Carrier Ethernet, and also [ITU-T_G.8121] for MPLS-TP).

4.1.3. Generic management requirements

Recommendation [ITU-T_G.7710] specifies the equipment management
function (EMF) requirements that are common to multiple transport
technologies and common to packet-based and circuit-based transport
networks. The Recommendation addresses the EMF inside a transport
network element, including the configuration, fault, and performance
(i.e. the C, F, P of FCAPS) management functions. The generic
management requirements in [ITU-T_G.7710] have been used as the
common basis for all technology-specific transport management

specifications (e.g., [ITU-T_G.784] for SDH, [ITU-T_G.874] for OTN,
[ITU-T_G.8051] for Carrier Ethernet, and [ITU-T_G.8151] for MPLS-TP.

4.1.4. Generic information model of transport network resources

ITU-T Recommendation [ITU-T_G.7711] and [ONF_TR-512] of ONF Common
Information Model (ONF-CIM) [ONF_TR-513] specify a core information
model for transport resources. The model is also applicable to the
management and control of the transport network regardless of the
technology of the underlying transport network. Furthermore, the
applicability of the information model is independent of the choice
of protocol to be used in the management and control interfaces. The
core information model defined in this Recommendation can be used as
the basis for the extension of transport/control-technology-specific
information models. Such extension will be specified in the
technology-specific Recommendations, such as [ITU-T_G.774] series for
SDH, [ITU-T_G.874.1] for OTN management, [ITU-T_G.8052] for Carrier
Ethernet management, [ITU-T_G.8152] for MPLS-TP management, and
[ITU-T_G.7718.1] for ASON control plane management.

4.2. Layer and Technology Specific Standards

4.2.1. Architecture

Recommendations [ITU-T_G.803] and [ITU-T_G.872] describe respectively
the functionality of the SDH and optical transport networks (OTN), L0
and L1, from a network level perspective using the generic principles
defined in [ITU-T_G.805] and [ITU-T_G.800]. [ITU-T_G.803] and
[ITU-T_G.872] describe the specific aspects concerning the SDH and
optical transport network layered structure, characteristic
information, client/server layer associations, network topology, and
layer network functionality. In accordance with [ITU-T_G.805] and
[ITU-T_G.800], the optical transport network is decomposed into
independent transport layer networks where each layer network can be
separately partitioned in a way which reflects the internal structure
of that layer network. In addition to reflecting the generic fault,
configuration, and performance management requirements, it describes
requirements for connection supervision (e.g., continuity,
connectivity, required maintenance information), signal quality
supervision, adaptation management, etc.) and connection supervision
techniques (i.e., inherent, non-intrusive, intrusive, and sublayer
monitoring).

Recommendation [ITU-T_G.8010] describes the functional architecture
of L2 Ethernet networks using the modelling methodology described in
[ITU-T_G.800] and [ITU-T_G.805]. The Ethernet network functionality
is described from a network level viewpoint, taking into account an
Ethernet network layered structure, client characteristic

information, client/server layer associations, networking topology,
and layer network functionality providing Ethernet signal
transmission, multiplexing, routing, supervision, performance
assessment, and network survivability. Recommendation [ITU-T_G.8010]
describes the relevant parts of the Ethernet specifications in
[IEEE_802.1Q] and [IEEE_802.3] using the ITU-T transport network
modelling methodology. The ETH layer network provides the transport
of adapted information through an ETH connectionless trail between
ETH access points. The adapted information is a (non-) continuous
flow of MAC service data units ([IEEE_802.3]).

Recommendation [ITU-T_G.8110.1] provides functional components, based
on Recommendation [ITU-T_G.805], that allow the Multi Protocol Label
Switching Transport Profile (MPLS-TP) to be modeled in a way that is
consistent with the description of other transport technologies
defined by the ITU-T to simplify integration with other transport
technologies. It provides a representation of the MPLS-TP technology
using the methodologies that have been used for other transport
technologies (e.g., SDH, OTN and Ethernet). In [ITU-T_G.8110.1], the
architecture of MPLS-TP forwarding, OAM, and network survivability
are modeled from a network-level viewpoint.

4.2.2. Transport Equipment Functions

Recommendations [ITU-T_G.783] and [ITU-T_G.798] specify both the
components and the methodology that should be used in order to
specify the respective SDH and OTN functionality of network elements.
This Recommendations uses the specification methodology defined in
[ITU-T_G.806], in general for transport network equipment, and is
based on the architecture of SDH transport networks defined in
[ITU-T_G.783] and optical transport networks defined in [ITU-T_G.872]
and the interfaces for SDH transport networks defined in
[ITU-T_G.707] and optical transport networks defined in
[ITU-T_G.709]. The description is generic and no particular physical
partitioning of functions is implied. The input/output information
flows associated with the functional blocks serve for defining the
functions of the blocks and are considered to be conceptual, not
physical. They also provides processes for SDH OAM based on
[ITU-T_G.707] and OTN OAM based on [ITU-T_G.709]. The functionality
defined in this Recommendation can be applied at user-to-network
interfaces (UNIs) and network node interfaces (NNIs) of the optical
transport network.

Recommendation [ITU-T_G.8021] specifies both the functional
components and the methodology that should be used in order to
specify the Ethernet transport network functionality of network
elements. This Recommendation uses the specification methodology
defined in [ITU-T_G.806] in general for transport network equipment

and is based on the architecture of Ethernet layer networks defined
in [ITU-T_G.8010], the interfaces for Ethernet transport networks
defined in [ITU-T_G.8012], and in support of services defined in
[ITU-T_G.8011]. It also provides processes for Ethernet OAM based on
[ITU-T_G.8013]. The description is generic and no particular
physical partitioning of functions is implied. The input/output
information flows associated with the functional blocks serve to
define the functions of the blocks and are considered to be
conceptual, not physical. The functionality defined in this
Recommendation can be applied at user-to-network interfaces (UNIs)
and network-to-network interfaces (NNIs) of the Ethernet transport
network.

Recommendation [ITU-T_G.8121] specifies both the functional
components and the methodology that should be used in order to
specify the multi-protocol label switching transport profile (MPLS-
TP) layer network functionality of network elements. This
Recommendation provides a representation of MPLS-TP technology which
uses the methodologies that have been used for other transport
technologies (e.g., optical transport network (OTN) and Ethernet).
It also provides generic processes for MPLS-TP OAM. It specifies a
library of basic building blocks and a set of rules by which they may
be combined in order to describe digital transmission equipment. The
library comprises the functional building blocks needed to specify
completely the generic functional structure of the MPLS-TP layer
network.

4.2.3. Transport management requirements

Recommendation [ITU-T_G.874] addresses management aspects of L0 and
L1 optical transport network elements containing transport functions
of one or more layer networks of the optical transport network (OTN).
It is based on the architecture of optical transport networks defined
in [ITU-T_G.872], the interfaces for OTN networks defined in
[ITU-T_G.709], and the OTN equipment function description defined in
[ITU-T_G.798]. The management functions for fault management,
configuration management, and performance management are specified.
Generic requirements in [ITU-T_G.7710] that are applicable to OTN are
identified in [ITU-T_G.874] via pointer references to [ITU-T_G.7710].
OTN-specific requirements explicitly specified include separation of
management communication network and signaling communication network,
OTN fault causes and failures, alarm reporting control (ARC) setting,
operational state, trail trace identifier configuration, adaptation
function configuration, connection function configuration, tandem
connection monitoring control function configuration, and the
management of the performance primitives.

Recommendation [ITU-T_G.8051] addresses management aspects of the L2
Ethernet Transport capable network element containing transport
functions of one or more of the layer networks of the Ethernet
transport network. The L2 Ethernet specific equipment functional
blocks are defined in [ITU-T_G.8021]. In this Recommendation, fault
management, configuration management, and performance management are
specified. Generic requirements in [ITU-T_G.7710] that are
applicable to Ethernet are identified in [ITU-T_G.8051] via pointer
references to [ITU-T_G.7710]. Ethernet-specific requirements
explicitly specified include the management communication channel,
fault causes and failures, alarm reporting control setting,
operational state, flow termination function configuration,
adaptation function configuration, connection function configuration,
diagnostic function configuration, traffic conditioning and shaping
function configuration, performance monitoring requirements, and the
management of the performance primitives.

Recommendation [ITU-T_G.8151] addresses management aspects of the
MPLS Transport Profile (MPLS-TP) capable network element, which is
separable from that of its client layer networks so that the same
means of management can be used regardless of the client. In this
Recommendation, fault management, configuration management, and
performance management are specified. The generic requirements for
managing transport network elements are specified in [ITU-T_G.7710]
and the requirements for the management of equipment used in networks
supporting an MPLS Transport Profile (MPLS-TP) are specified in [IETF
RFC 5951]. This Recommendation specifies the requirements for
managing the MPLS-TP specific equipment functional blocks, which are
defined in [ITU-T_G.8121].

4.2.4. Management Information Models

Recommendation [ITU-T_G.874.1] provides a management-protocol-neutral
information model for managing network elements in the L0 and L1
optical transport network (OTN) [ITU-T_G.872], [ITU-T_G.709], and
[ITU-T_G.798] and supporting the management requirements specified in
[ITU-T_G.7710] and [ITU-T_G.874]. It identifies the managed entities
required for the management of OTN network elements, including
Termination Points (TP), Tandem Connection Monitoring (TCM), Non-
Intrusive Monitoring (NIM), Delay Measurement (DM), and the general
Performance Monitoring (PM) Current Data (CD) and History Data (HD).
These entities are relevant to information exchanged across
standardized management interfaces. The management-protocol-neutral
information model should be used as the base for defining management-
protocol-specific data schema. The specific mapping of the
management-protocol-neutral information model into management-
protocol-specific data schema is the decision of the management-
protocol-specific solution designer. The information model specified

in this Recommendation allows for managing the OTN functional capabilities of the NE.

Recommendation [ITU-T_G.8052] provides a management-protocol-neutral information model for managing network elements in the L2 Ethernet transport network [ITU-T_G.8010], [ITU-T_G.8012], and [ITU-T_G.8021] and supporting the management requirements specified in [ITU-T_G.7710] and [ITU-T_G.8051]. It identifies the managed entities required for the management of Ethernet transport network elements, including Termination Points (TP), Maintenance Entity Group (MEG) End Point (MEP), MEG Intermediate Point (MIP), Traffic Conditioning and Shaping (TCS), Loss Measurement (LM), Delay Measurement (DM), and the general Performance Monitoring (PM) Current Data (CD) and History Data (HD). These entities are relevant to information exchanged across standardized management interfaces. The management-protocol-neutral information model should be used as the base for defining management-protocol-specific data schema. The specific mapping of the management-protocol-neutral information model into management-protocol-specific data schema is the decision of the management-protocol-specific solution design. The information model specified in this Recommendation allows for managing the Ethernet functional capabilities of the NE.

It should also be noted that [MEF_7.2] specifies the EMS-NMS interface profile needed to support Metro Ethernet services, which provides the profile of management entities based on [ITU-T_Q.840.1] and [ITU-T_G.8052] and a mapping to the TMF's MTNM 3.5[TMF_MTNM] Ethernet model. Work is in progress on [MEF_7.3], which describes the Carrier Ethernet Service Management Information Model for the management of MEF Carrier Ethernet services, including EVC and OVC as customer facing services. There are additionally other protocol-neutral MEF information modeling activities underway (e.g., MEF Network Resource Management Information Model to specify mapping from the [MEF_7.3] Service Model to a Network Resource Model based upon [ONF_TR-512] and [ITU-T_G.8052].

Recommendation [ITU-T_G.8152] provides a management-protocol-neutral information model for managing network elements in the L2 MPLS-TP network [ITU-T_G.8110.1], [ITU-T_G.8112], and [ITU-T_G.8121] series and supporting the management requirements specified in [ITU-T_G.7710] and [ITU-T_G.8151]. It identifies the managed entities required for the management of MPLS-TP network elements, including Termination Points (TP), Maintenance Entity Group (MEG) End Point (MEP), MEG Intermediate Point (MIP), Loss Measurement (LM), Delay Measurement (DM), and the general Performance Monitoring (PM) Current Data (CD) and History Data (HD). These entities are relevant to information exchanged across standardized management interfaces. The management-protocol-neutral information model should be used as

the base for defining management-protocol-specific data schema. The
specific mapping of the management-protocol-neutral information model
into management-protocol-specific data schema is the decision of the
management-protocol-specific solution design. The information model
specified in this Recommendation allows for managing the MPLS-TP
functional capabilities of the NE.

5. Discussion

This draft has provided an introduction to the significant body of
specifications developed in ITU-T that detail the generic
architectural principles for OAM in (multi layer) transport networks.
It also provides an introduction to the specifications that apply
those general principles in a consistent way to various layered
transport network technologies. It is anticipated that the generic
and layer specific OAM architecture and management specifications
described in this draft will prove valuable in considerations of
generic unified approaches to OAM and management for additional
multilayer networks.

6. Acknowledgements

7. Contributors

8. IANA Considerations

This memo includes no request to IANA.

9. Security Considerations

This informational document is solely intended to provide a summary
of the existing ITU-T SG 15 standards, (Layer 0 - Layer 2) both
technology-specific and generic across these technologies, relevant
to leveraging OAM to support fault management, performance
monitoring, and configuration management. No security threat is
introduced by this informational document.

10. References

10.1. Normative References

   [IEEE_802.1Q]
             IEEE, "Media Access Control (MAC) Bridges and Virtual
             Bridged Local Area Networks, IEEE Std 802.1Q-2014", 2014.

   [IEEE_802.3]
             IEEE, "Carrier sense multiple access with collision
             detection (CSMA/CD) access method and physical layer
             specifications, IEEE Std 802.3-2015", 2015.

   [ITU-T_G.707]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.707/Y.1322 - Network node interface for
             the synchronous digital hierarchy (SDH), 01/2007, Amd.1
             07/2007, Amd. 2 11/2009", 2007,
             <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.707/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.709]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.709/Y.1331 - Interfaces for the optical
             transport network (OTN), 02/2012", 2012,
             <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.709/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.7710]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.7710/Y.1701 - Common Equipment Management
             Function Requirements; 02/2012", 2012,
             <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.7710/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.7711]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.7711/Y.1702, Generic protocol-neutral
             management Information Model for transport network
             resources", 2015.

   [ITU-T_G.7718.1]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.7718.1/Y.1709.1 - Protocol-neutral
             management information model for the control plane view;
             12/2006", 2006,
             <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.7718.1/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.774]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.774 - Synchronous digital hierarchy (SDH)
             - Management information model for the network element
             view ; 02/2001", 2001,
             <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.774/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.783]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.783 - Characteristics of Synchronous
             Digital Hierarchy (SDH) equipment functional blocks;
             03/2006", 2006, <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.783/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.784]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.784 - Management aspects of synchronous
             digital hierarchy (SDH) transport network elements ;
             03/2008", 2008, <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.784/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.798]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.798 - Characteristics of optical transport
             network hierarchy equipment functional blocks; 12/2012",
             2012, <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.798/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.800]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.800 - Unified Model; 02/2012", 2012,
             <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.800/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.8010]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.8010/Y.1306 - Architecture of Ethernet
             Layer Networks; 02/2004", 2004,
             <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.8010/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.8011]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.8011/Y.1307 - Ethernet service
             characteristics; 01/2015", 2015,
             <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.8011/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.8012]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.8010/Y.1308 - Ethernet UNI and Ethernet
             NNI; 08/2004", 2004,
             <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.8012/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.8013]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.8013/Y.1731 - OAM functions and mechanisms
             for Ethernet based networks; 8/2015", 2015,
             <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.8013/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.8021]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.8021/Y.1341 - Characteristics of Ethernet
             transport network equipment functional blocks; 04/2015",
             2012, <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.8021/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.803]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.803 - Architecture of Transport Networks
             based on the Synchronous Digital Hierarchy (SDH);
             03/2000", 2000, <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.803/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.805]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.805 - Generic functional architecture of
             transport networks; 10/2000", 2000,
             <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.805/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.8051]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.8051/Y.1345 - Management aspects of the
             Ethernet - over - Transport (EoT) capable network element;
             08/2013", 2013, <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.8051/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.8052]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.8052/Y.1346 - Protocol-neutral management
             information model for the Ethernet transport capable
             network element; 08/2013", 2013,
             <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.8052/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.806]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.806 - Characteristics of Transport
             Equipment - Description Methodology and Generic
             Functionality, 02/2012", 2012,
             <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.806/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.8110.1]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.8110.1/Y.1370.1 - Architecture of MPLS
             Transport Profile (MPLS-TP) layer network; 12/2011", 2011,
             <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.8110.1/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.8112]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.8110.1/Y.1371 - Interfaces for the MPLS
             Transport Profile layer network ; 8/2015", 2015,
             <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.8112/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.8113.2]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.8113.2/Y.1372.2 - Operations,
             administration and maintenance mechanisms for MPLS-TP
             networks using the tools defined for MPLS; 8/2015", 2015,
             <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.8113.2/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.8121]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.8121/Y.1371 - Characteristics of MPLS-TP
             equipment functional blocks; 11/2013", 2013,
             <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.8121/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.8151]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.8151/Y.1374 - Management aspects of the
             MPLS-TP network element; 01/2015", 2015,
             <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.8151/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.8152]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.8152/Y.1375 (draft in progress), Protocol-
             neutral management information model for the MPLS-TP
             network element", 201x.

   [ITU-T_G.872]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.872 - Architecture of optical transport
             networks; 10/2012", 2012,
             <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.872/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.874]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.874 - Management aspects of the optical
             transport network element; 08/2013", 2013,
             <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.874/en>.

   [ITU-T_G.874.1]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T G.874.1 - Optical transport network (OTN)
             protocol-neutral management information model for the
             network element view; 10/2012", 2012,
             <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-G.874.1/en>.

   [ITU-T_Q.840.1]
             ITU-T, "ITU-T Q.840.1 - Requirements and analysis for NMS-
             EMS management interface of Ethernet over Transport and
             Metro Ethernet Network (EoT/MEN)", 2007,
             <http://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-Q.840.1/en>.

   [MEF_7.2] MEF, "Carrier Ethernet Information Model", 2013, <http://w
             ww.metroethernetforum.org/Assets/Technical_Specifications/
             PDF/MEF7.2.pdf>.

   [MEF_7.3] MEF, "Carrier Ethernet Management Information Model (Draft
             in Process)", 201x.

   [ONF_TR-512]
             ONF, "TR-512 Core Information Model 1.1", 2015,
             <https://www.opennetworking.org/images/stories/downloads/
             sdn-resources/technical-reports/ONF-
             CIM_Core_Model_base_document_1.1.pdf>.

   [ONF_TR-513]
             ONF, "TR-513 Common Information Model Overview 1.1", 2015,
             <https://www.opennetworking.org/images/stories/downloads/
             sdn-resources/technical-reports/
             Common_Information_Model_CIM_Overview_1.pdf>.

   [RFC2119] Bradner, S., "Key words for use in RFCs to Indicate
             Requirement Levels", BCP 14, RFC 2119,
             DOI 10.17487/RFC2119, March 1997,
             <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc2119>.

[RFC5860]   Vigoureux, M., Ed., Ward, D., Ed., and M. Betts, Ed.,
            "Requirements for Operations, Administration, and
            Maintenance (OAM) in MPLS Transport Networks", RFC 5860,
            DOI 10.17487/RFC5860, May 2010,
            <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5860>.

[RFC5950]   Mansfield, S., Ed., Gray, E., Ed., and K. Lam, Ed.,
            "Network Management Framework for MPLS-based Transport
            Networks", RFC 5950, DOI 10.17487/RFC5950, September 2010,
            <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5950>.

[RFC5951]   Lam, K., Mansfield, S., and E. Gray, "Network Management
            Requirements for MPLS-based Transport Networks", RFC 5951,
            DOI 10.17487/RFC5951, September 2010,
            <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5951>.

[RFC6371]   Busi, I., Ed. and D. Allan, Ed., "Operations,
            Administration, and Maintenance Framework for MPLS-Based
            Transport Networks", RFC 6371, DOI 10.17487/RFC6371,
            September 2011, <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc6371>.

[RFC6424]   Bahadur, N., Kompella, K., and G. Swallow, "Mechanism for
            Performing Label Switched Path Ping (LSP Ping) over MPLS
            Tunnels", RFC 6424, DOI 10.17487/RFC6424, November 2011,
            <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc6424>.

[RFC6428]   Allan, D., Ed., Swallow, G., Ed., and J. Drake, Ed.,
            "Proactive Connectivity Verification, Continuity Check,
            and Remote Defect Indication for the MPLS Transport
            Profile", RFC 6428, DOI 10.17487/RFC6428, November 2011,
            <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc6428>.

[TMF_MTNM]
            TM Forum, "TM Forum Multi Technology Network Management,
            Release 3.5", 2009,
            <http://www.tmforum.org/MTNM/1689/www.tmforum.org/
            DownloadCenter/7549/home.html#mtnm>.

10.2. Informative References

[OTN_Handbook]
            ITU-T, "ITU-T OTN Handbook - Optical Transport Networks
            from TDM to Packet, ITU-T Manual 2010", 2010.

Appendix A. Additional Stuff

    TBD

Authors' Addresses

    Kam Lam (editor)
    Nokia
    USA

    Phone: +1 732 331 3476
    Email: kam.lam@nokia.com

    Eve Varma (editor)
    Nokia
    USA

    Email: eve.varma@nokia.com

    Scott Mansfield (editor)
    Ericsson
    USA

    Phone: +1 724 931 9316
    Email: scott.mansfield@ericsson.com

    Yuji Tochio (editor)
    Fujitsu
    Japan

    Email: tochio@jp.fujitsu.com

    Huub van Helvoort (editor)
    Hai Gaoming BV
    The Netherlands

    Phone: +31 924 8936
    Email: huubatwork@gmail.com

Maarten Vissers (editor)
Huawei
China

Phone: +31 62 611 2004
Email: maarten.vissers@huawei.com

Paul Doolan (editor)
Coriant
Germany

Phone: +1 972 357 5822
Email: paul.doolan@coriant.com